Book Review
Hara, A.E., Indriastuti, S., & Trihartono, A. (2023). *Keamanan Insani (Human Security): Eksplorasi berbagai Perspektif di Dunia.* Pandiva. 238 pp

Annisa Rizkyta[1*], Nur Zahrun Al Jannah[2]

[1]Centre for Research in Social Sciences and Humanities (C-RiSSH), Jember University
[2]Centre for Research in Social Sciences and Humanities (C-RiSSH), Jember University
email : annisarizkytahsbn@gmail.com

Abstract

The book reviewed in this paper examines the concept of human security, which is an expanded perspective of state security. This book by Hara, Suyani and Trihartono offers a comprehensive exploration of the global perspective of human security. While detailing the human security perspectives of the UNDP, Japan, Canada and the European Union, the book also highlights Indonesia's unique position. The book emphasizes the role of Religious Non-State Actors (RNSAs) in addressing human security issues. Using primary data in its final chapter, the book advocates for a reinterpretation of human security in Indonesia that is adapted to diverse social and historical contexts. In addition, this review finds that the in-depth interpretations in this book provide opportunities for further exploration or study for future researchers.

Keywords: *human security; religious non-state actors; Indonesia*

Abstrak

Buku yang ditinjau dalam tulisan ini membahas tentang konsep keamanan manusia yang merupakan perluasan perspektif dari keamanan negara. Buku karya Hara, Suyani, dan Trihartono ini menawarkan eksplorasi yang komprehensif tentang perspektif keamanan manusia secara global. Selain merinci sudut pandang keamanan manusia menurut UNDP, Jepang, Kanada, dan Uni Eropa, buku ini juga menyoroti posisi Indonesia yang unik. Buku ini menekankan peran Aktor Agama Non-Negara (RNSA) dalam menangani masalah keamanan manusia. Dengan menggunakan data primer dalam bab terakhirnya, buku ini mengadvokasi penafsiran ulang keamanan manusia di Indonesia yang disesuaikan dengan konteks sosial dan sejarah yang beragam. Selain itu, ulasan ini menemukan bahwa interpretasi yang mendalam dalam buku ini memberi peluang eksplorasi atau studi lebih lanjut bagi peneliti lain di masa mendatang.

Kata Kunci: *keamanan manusia; religious non-state actors; Indonesia*

[*]**Corresponding Author** : Annisa Rizkyta (*annisarizkytahsbn@gmail.com*). Centre for Research in Social Sciences and Humanities (C-RiSSH), Jember University. Jl. Kalimantan No. 37 – Kampus Bumi Tegalboto Kotak POS 159 Jember, Jawa Timur, 68121

Introduction

Human security (HS) is a relatively new perspective in security studies that previously centred on state security. Its main focus is on human beings who are threatened in various aspects such as health, security, education, and even their very existence. This perspective is expanding rapidly around the world, mainly because it has been neglected for too long in the dominant paradigm of state security. The protection of state security is often seen as suppressing human security itself.

In line with the globalization of this concept, in Indonesia, human security has also been incorporated into the National Research Master Plan. Even in the National Security Bill, human security is included as a perspective to perceive Indonesia's security. The National Development Planning Agency (Bappenas) has also researched to develop the Indonesian Human Security Index. On other occasions, academics have also suggested that human security should be the main focus of Indonesia's foreign policy. However, despite being a dominant discourse, the progress of human security to become an official part of state policy, including becoming an official law, is still relatively slow.

Based on this background, Hara decided to write a book entitled "*Keamanan Insani* (Human Security): *Eksplorasi berbagai Perspektif di Dunia*" (Human Security: An Exploration of Various Perspectives in the World) with Agus Trihartono and Suyani Indriastuti. The question, of course, is why the concept of human security has not become a dominant discourse in Indonesian security studies. According to this book, one of the reasons is that Indonesia has its own experiences, needs, and views on human security. HS has been a concern for a long time with community involvement in various organizations to deal with it. To examine this in-depth, it is necessary to explore the development of the concept and practice of human security at the global level and how it differs from that in Indonesia. It is also necessary to know how HS has been implemented in Indonesia (Hara et al., 2023). In this fairly detailed work, the authors have succeeded in describing the development of this concept over time.

Discussion

It is the first Indonesian-language book to comprehensively collect and explain human security from various perspectives around the world. The book, which was just published in early 2023, has an illustrative-style cover design with images of mountains, rivers, and the sun, which are often represented as the source of human life. The book contains a total of 238 pages divided into six chapters, with an opening chapter and five chapters focusing on the human security perspectives of the UNDP, Japan, Canada, the European Union, and Indonesia, respectively. In general, the authors try to explain the background of the emergence of the human security concept in each perspective, its development, and implementation, as well as the criticisms and challenges it faces. In addition, this book review includes a summary of each chapter, the strengths, and limitations of the book, conclusions, and an overview.

The opening chapter of this book discusses the genesis of human security concepts. This concept dates back to the realism perspective that focuses on traditional security, which is state-based security. After the Cold War, this concept shifted towards individual security issues, which are non-traditional security. This shift led to the birth of the concept of human security (Hara, et al., 2023, p. 5). The emergence of this concept explains that security issues have evolved in many sectors, such as economic, political, social, and environmental threats. Fundamentally, the concept assumes that human security is universal, people-centred, preventive, interdependent, and multi-dimensional. Therefore, the presence of this concept encourages the formation of diverse perspectives, ranging from the perspectives of international organizations to those of nation-states in the process of understanding. However, as will be elaborated later, one perspective that is overlooked is that of community organizations that are featured in Indonesia's case.

In the second chapter, the first perspective discussed comes from the United Nations Development Program (UNDP). The authors analyzed this perspective based on the Human Development Report (HDR) released by UNDP in 1994. In this report, there is a value of "universalism of life claims" that characterizes

human security from the UNDP perspective (UNDP, 1994). This value emphasizes the urgency of human security and development in the future (Hara, et al., 2023, p.28). Furthermore, the authors carefully review the security approach of this value which consists of freedom from fear, freedom from want, and freedom to live in dignity. From these three approaches, UNDP formulates seven aspects of security that must be owned by every individual, namely economic security, environmental security, food security, personal security, community security, political security, and health security. The authors also criticize and challenge UNDP's perspective, which is considered not optimal to be an operational guide for countries in the world.

Then, in the third chapter, the authors analyze human security from the Japanese perspective. Japan is a country that applied the concept of HS very early on. The authors explain that HS has long been a part of Japan's national security concept. Two national security concepts characterize the Japanese perspective, namely "shaka hosho" (social security) and "chian" (public security). Both of these have one essence in common, which leads to the "freedom from want" value. In practice at the domestic level, Japan focuses on handling natural disasters and migration issues. Then at the international level, Japan implemented Official Development Assistance (ODA) and initiated the establishment of the United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security (UNTFHS) with the UN. This means that Japan has a responsive perspective in understanding and practising the concept of human security. Nevertheless, there are some weaknesses in Japan's security implementation. The authors found a lack of synchronization between the local and central government in understanding the concept of human security in Japan (Hara, et al., 2023, p.88).

The fourth chapter, the Canadian perspective, explains the importance of the country's role as one of the pioneers of human security in the world, including by initiating the Human Security Network (HSN). Canada's commitment to human security is a response to an increasingly complex global reality, characterized by the emergence of various threats that are no longer limited to military attacks. For this reason, Canada has made human security

that focuses on the "freedom from fear" approach as its foreign policy paradigm. By putting people at the center of its policy, the country believes that national and international security will improve (Hara, et al., 2023, p.94). In the process of implementation, although Canada has been at the forefront of this field, there is a view that the country is no longer making human security its top priority due to power shifts. This is reflected in the decreasing Canadian humanitarian assistance in several international peacekeeping missions. Therefore, Canada needs to work harder to be re-recognized as a human security advocate in the world.

Being one of the pioneering countries in the implementation of human security, the fourth chapter would have benefited from explaining Canada's contribution to the practice of human security at home and abroad, instead of just briefly mentioning it. Actual actions such as peace support operations are widely featured on the Canadian government's official website, making it easier for the authors to elaborate on them. Replicating the third chapter's writing structure could be a good choice.

In the fifth chapter, the authors elaborate on the human security perspective of the European Union (EU). Similar to Canada, this supranational organization's approach focuses on freedom from fear, which was triggered by the 9/11 tragedy in the US and the 2004 bomb attacks in Spain. The EU's seriousness in supporting human security can be witnessed from the establishment of the European Security Strategy (ESS) in December 2003. The ESS aims to address five main threats: terrorism, the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction, regional conflicts, failed states, and organized crime (Hara, et al., 2023, pp.120-121). Not only do they discuss human security at the organizational level, but the authors also explore the development of HS at the level of EU countries such as Switzerland, Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, Finland, and Sweden. This chapter then comprehensively demonstrates the criticisms and challenges faced by the EU in implementing human security such as the concept being too vague, the lack of a gender perspective, and legitimacy concerns over humanitarian interventions.

After exploring various perspectives on human security dominated by the perspectives of

international organizations and developed countries, the authors begin to map Indonesia's position as a third-world country in understanding and applying the concept of human security. While other countries have made HS a paradigm of their foreign policy, it seems that Indonesia has yet to officially adopt this norm. Efforts to institutionalize human security through the National Security Bill have not shown significant progress since it was drafted in 2012. The same goes for the plan to create an Indonesian Human Security Index by the Ministry of National Development Planning (Bappenas). Based on the authors' analysis, the biggest obstacle lies in the state's limitations in taking on HS responsibilities, which are considered "too heavy" (Hara, et al., 2023, p.202). There is also a dilemma between state security and individual protection because in some cases such as separatism and other internal conflicts, maintaining the integrity of Indonesia is the government's priority. However, from a human security perspective, some of the state's aggressive actions in this context are considered violations of civil rights.

Another reason why the concept of human security has not been part of official policy may also be that in Indonesia, concern for HS has been around since colonial times. Colonization was the earliest and most serious violation of human security. The people at that time could not wait for the state (which was the colonial government) to protect them. Therefore, non-state actors have taken a dominant role in the implementation of HS in Indonesia since then. In this book, the authors pay special attention to Religious Non-State Actors (RNSA) who have contributed for a long time but have never been considered human security actors.

Unlike the previous five chapters, which heavily relied on secondary data, the sixth chapter on Indonesia's human security perspective is supported by a lot of primary data derived from interviews and focus group discussions involving state and non-state actors. This is one of the strengths of this book because the authors can get richer and more valid information. As a result, they found that the substance of HS already existed in Indonesia even before it was widely disseminated by UNDP in 1994, although not under the name "human security". Then the authors found a very

fundamental difference, that is, when other countries rely on their governments, efforts to achieve human security in Indonesia have been carried out by RNSAs such as Muhammadiyah, Nahdlatul Ulama, and Bethesda even since colonialism. This is still missing in human security studies both globally and locally as most existing studies are limited to the role of state actors. Some papers only revolve around the period after the dissemination of this norm by UNDP such as in Susetyo (2008), Fitrah (2015), and Santoso et al. (2022).

Based on the findings above, the authors propose a reinterpretation of human security by adjusting the social conditions and historical experiences of each country. This is indeed important to do because the HS norms disseminated by UNDP are dominated by Western perspectives so they are less relevant to the circumstances of third-world countries. States and civil societies can translate human security with their cultural and even religious approaches because they are the ones who best understand the problems they face. This is what Muhammadiyah, Nahdlatul Ulama, and Bethesda seem to apply as they pursue to overcome poverty, help the sick, mitigate the impact of natural disasters, and build a better education system. The contributions of these three RNSAs, as briefly described in this book, have contributed to the development of human security in Indonesia. Hopefully, the role of civil society groups can be more recognized in the context of human security because, in practice, they are the social capital that "replaces" the state in addressing human security issues in Indonesia.

Throughout the first five chapters, the authors bring a fairly detailed explanation of the various perspectives on human security in the world. However, one of the book's shortcomings is that it is too general. "Indonesian Perspective" is the only chapter that provides strong arguments and a unique perspective. It would have been better if the authors had provided a deeper and more critical interpretation of HS theory and practice from the perspectives of UNDP, Japan, Canada, and the EU to provide a fresh, if not original, perspective. This would provide a balance of substance to the book.

On the other hand, the authors have only discussed the representation of the continents of Asia (Japan and Indonesia), North America

(Canada) and Europe (EU). Some continents have not been explored by the authors such as Australia, Africa, and South America. This lack of exploration can be an opportunity for future writing. Adding an Australian perspective, for example, would be a good idea as it has a unique approach to dealing with non-traditional security threats such as climate change, migration, and terrorism.

Meanwhile, from a technical point of view, the chapter structures in this book differ from one another. Writing a consistent chapter structure will make it easier for the reader to see the important aspects that distinguish one perspective from another. We think this is important to consider. Given that each perspective has its characteristics, this book would be more comprehensive if the authors could show the comparison of each perspective on certain aspects, for example using tables.

In addition, the use of sentences that are too long and repetitive in many sections should have been avoided. This will help the reader to find the main essence of the reading more effectively. Since there is already a genesis of the human security concept in the first chapter, a general overview of human security does not need to be repeated in every chapter that discusses the perspectives of states and international organizations on it.

Given that this book was published in 2023, the author could have enriched the analysis with more recent issues. For example, taking into account the issue of the COVID-19 pandemic that has changed many aspects of global life. It can be very relevant to reflect on how this pandemic has affected the concept and practice of human security from various perspectives. This discussion will not only enhance the understanding of human security in the context of the global health crisis but can also provide insights on how security strategies can be adapted for similar emergencies in the future. Thus, consideration of this issue can deepen the analysis and relevance of this book to contemporary and pressing issues in human security.

Overall, the aim of this book to seek Indonesian perspectives on human security among other existing global perspectives has been achieved in some respects. However, we find that the explanations of each of the global perspectives still require deeper interpretation and a more consistent structure of contents. Nonetheless, this book makes several important contributions to the study of human security. First, it shows that approaches to human security vary from country to country. The UNDP perspective, which is promoted as an international guideline for human security, is not fully relevant to the implementation in each country due to different social, cultural, political, and economic conditions. Secondly, this book is arguably quite up-to-date because it can explain the latest developments and projected challenges for human security from each perspective. Thirdly, the book bridges the Western and Eastern perspectives of human security, enabling the readers to see that different case studies must be understood with different approaches.

Conclusion

This book is an essential read for anyone interested in understanding the complexities of the modern world, especially when it comes to human security. It has opened up a wide discussion on the future of global security, particularly non-traditional security, and our role in achieving it. It also offers constructive and applicable policy recommendations for the development of human security in Indonesia. This is supported by the authors' research, data, and personal experiences, providing a refreshing and factual perspective. Despite its limitations, this book provides an opportunity for the readers to conduct further research in the future by utilizing some of the themes that have been recommended by the author at the end of the book.

References

Fitrah, E. (2015). Gagasan Human Security Dan Kebijakan Keamanan Nasional Indonesia. *Insignia: Journal of International Relations*, 2(1), 27–41. https://doi.org/10.20884/1.INS.2015.2.01.434

Hara, A. E., Indriastuti, S., & Trihartono, A. (2023). *Keamanan Insani (Human*

Security): Ekspolorasi berbagai Perspektif di Dunia. Pandiva.

Santoso, R. N. P., Budiarto, A., & Azhari, Y. (2022). Implementasi Konsep Keamanan Insani (Human Security) di Indonesia dalam Konteks Damai dan Resolusi Konflik. *Jurnal Education and Development,* 10(2), 1–3. https://doi.org/10.37081/ed.v10i2.3502

Susetyo, H. (2008). Menuju Paradigma Keamanan Komprehensif Berperspektif Keamanan Manusia Dalam Kebijakan Keamanan Nasional Indonesia. *Lex Jurnalica*, 6(1). https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.47007/lj.v6i1.287

Book Cover